

Damodar Basin is mainly in the context of coalfields where heavy mineral data from the Karharbari-Barakar have been reported.

That 'many coalfields in Damodar Basin may have their own peculiarities' is not relevant as far as the comparison of heavy minerals is concerned. To the best of my knowledge of Gondwana rocks, there are indeed more similarities than differences in the lithostratigraphy, gross lithic-fill composition, lithofacies organisation and their dispersal in various coalfields of Damodar Basin.

We have already referred to paleocurrents based on regional studies (Casshyap, 1973; Casshyap and Tewari, 1984) for interpreting the location of provenance. The theme of the paper does not warrant an elaborate account of paleocurrent analysis.

Statistical approach is desirable where study covers a large area including more than one parameter, but not in the present case where a single core was involved.

Department of Geology
D. S. College, Aligarh-202 001

R. C. TEWARI

References

- CASSHYAP, S. M. (1973) Paleocurrents and paleogeographic reconstructions in the Barakar (Lower Gondwana) sandstones of Peninsular India. *Sediment. Geol.*, v. 9, pp. 283-303.
- (1979) A stratigraphic and sedimentologic investigation of the Gondwana rocks and its bearing on coal productivity in the Singrauli coalfield, U.P. (Unpublished Report), SCST, Lucknow, U.P.
- CASSHYAP, S. M. and TEWARI, R. C. (1984) Fluvial models of the lower Permian coal measures of Son-Mahanadi and Koel-Damodar valley basins, India. *In*: R. A. Rahmani and R. M. Flores (eds.). *Coal and Coal Bearing Sequences*. Special Pub. Intern. Asso. Sedimento., v. 7, pp. 121-147.
- SASTRY, M. V. A., ACHARYYA, S. K., SHAH, S. C., SATSANGI, P. P., GHOSH, S. C., RAHA, P. K., SINGH GOPAL and GHOSH, R. N. (1977) *Stratigraphic Lexicon of Gondwana formations of India*. Misc. Pub., v. 36, pp. 1-170.

2

Comment

(A Comment on the paper entitled 'Clay Mineralogy of the Pelagic Sediments: Along a West-East Transect in the Indian Ocean' by G. S. Roonwal and S. K. Srivastava, published in the *Journal of the Geological Society of India*, Vol. 38, No. 1, July 1991, pp. 37-54).

This paper appears to be a clear case of plagiarism of my Ph.D. thesis, the external examiner of which was Dr. Roonwal. In support of my statement I am giving below the following details.

1. On page 37 and 44, the entire description of the clay mineralogy technique is copied in its entirety from my thesis (Xerox copy enclosed).
2. On page 50, the sentence starting with the TiO_2/Al_2O_3 ratio is again a copy of the material from my thesis (Xerox copy enclosed).
3. On page 54, the concluding paragraph is also verbatim copy of the material from my thesis (Xerox copy enclosed).

4. In further support of my contention of plagiarism, I would like to point out that 'Results and Discussions' part of this paper discusses the north to south variation of various parameters (as in my thesis), whereas his sample transect is in the east-west direction as shown in his Figure 1.
5. In order to further suppress the source of plagiarism, the authors have not cited either my Ph.D. Thesis or the two earlier papers reporting work in the same area, namely, Rao and Nath, 1988 and Nath *et al.* 1979.
6. I refrain from passing comments on the scientific content on the Results and Discussions part, but in passing would like to mention that there are many irrelevant and doubtful statements. Details of these will be provided if required.

I, therefore, strongly feel that this is a clear case of misleading the scientific community by publishing outright plagiarised material.

*National Institute of Oceanography
Dona Paula, Goa 403004.*

V. PURNACHANDRA RAO

References

- RAO, V. P. and NAIK, B. N. (1988) Nature, distribution and origin of clay minerals in grain size fractions of sediments from manganese nodule field. Central Indian Basin. *Indian Jour. Marine Sciences*, v. 17, pp. 202-207.
- NATH, B. N., RAO, V. P. and BECKER, K. P. (1989) Geochemical evidence of terrigenous influence in Deep-Sea sediments up to 8°S in the central Indian Basin. *Marine Geology*, v. 87, pp. 301-313.

Reply

I have since examined the matter in some detail and would state that some one has tampered with the manuscript here. As the MS was typed on the PC, it has not been possible for me to check the original version, and my long absence from India, the notes and other extra material has been disposed off. But it is clear that the notes prepared were put in the PC and assimilated in the MS. The omission of reference of Dr. V. P. Rao is regretted.

Although the methodology of investigation are known both for the mineralogy and geochemistry, this sort of verbatim reproduction has come in inadvertently and is regretted.

But whoever has done this from within my group, as the present paper is published in my authorship, I express my sincere regret at this unfortunate incident. I would like to assure you that my data is original and open to any one for inspection.

*Delhi University
Delhi 110007*

G. S. ROONWAL

We must admit that the reply given is far from convincing. So long as the circumstances under which several paragraphs from an unpublished thesis of a research worker have been extracted without acknowledging the same is not clearly explained, such action will continue to remain suspect. We do trust this matter will be probed further—(Ed.).